

# In the Labyrinth of Pain There Is No Such Thing as Selected Victims: the Evolution of Trafficking in Human Beings' Definition

**Angelina Stanojoska, PhD<sup>1</sup>**  
**e-mail: angiest22@gmail.com**

**Elena Tilovska - Kechegi, PhD<sup>2</sup>**  
**e-mail: elena-tilovska-kechegi@hotmail.com**

**Mirjana Ristovska, PhD<sup>3</sup>**  
**e-mail: mimaristovska@yahoo.co.uk**

## Abstract

*Defining phenomena has always been necessary for successful making of a general picture of what we encounter. If we have a definition it will be easier to encounter such phenomena, explain their internal structure, understand it and find out solutions for its suppression and prevention.*

*Trafficking in human beings is only a small part of the phenomena for which international community still hasn't formed a mutually acceptable definition. It must be admitted that forming a definition is a long process, process in which a phenomenon must be explained from different theoretical approaches and brought into the social value system.*

*The paper gives a chronological review of the process of creating today's trafficking in human beings definition which is part of the Palermo Protocol. Making such an overview would help us understand its complexity, but also the complexity and length of such processes.*

**Key words:** *definition, international documents, process, term, trafficking in human beings.*

## Introduction

The problems within the evolving trafficking discourse are particularly troubling as regards two key issues: significant definitional uncertainty regarding the crime; and a striking lack of quantitative and qualitative data on actual trafficking practices. These problems are not simply areas of intellectual discord. Instead, they threaten the coherence and value of the preventative and punitive potential of anti-trafficking policies.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law, University "St. Clement of Ohrid" - Bitola, Republic of Macedonia

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law, University "St. Clement of Ohrid" - Bitola, Republic of Macedonia

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law, University "St. Clement of Ohrid" - Bitola, Republic of Macedonia

<sup>4</sup> Cherif Bassiouni, *Addressing International Human Trafficking in Women and Children for Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, 10<sup>th</sup> Specialization Course in International Criminal Law – Human Trafficking for Commercial Sexual Exploitation, ISISC (2010), p.4

These issues are directly linked to the way in which the current understanding of trafficking has evolved out of a history of international legal mechanisms of addressing four key types of harm: chattel slavery and later other forms of slavery and servitude; prostitution (in particular “white slavery”); labor violations; and organized crime. Each of these types of human suffering have conceptualized and addressed through public campaigns and using legal instruments and mechanisms designed to prevent their occurrence and punish those responsible for committing these acts.<sup>5</sup>

Although there are many efforts put towards using only one term which will define trafficking in human beings in every country, today, there are formulations that explain trafficking in human beings as buying and selling of people, or try to explain a phenomenon which is closer to smuggling, that is connected to crossing borders. For example, the English term “trafficking” can inadequately cover exploitation. The Arabian term for trafficking in human beings “al-ittijaar b’il-bashar”, the word “al-ittijaar” means “marketing” or “trade”. In the Russian word “торговля людьми”, the first word also means trade. The French “le traite des personnes”, Italian “trata di persone” and Spanish “trata de personas” can also be used for negotiations or trade agreements. French people sometimes even don’t use the part “le traite”, because it can be connected to “le traite des noirs” from the time of the Transatlantic slave trade from Africa to Europe. Also, in many countries where Spanish is the official language, the term “la trata” is connected to the term “la trata de blancas”, which is a term from the period of trafficking in “white slaves”. After all, this phrase is better to be used, because “trafico de personas” is used for smuggling in migrants, and in Latin American countries “el trafico” is often used in explaining trafficking in drugs and weapons.

Using such limited terms in most cases are reason for confusion in terms of making effective legal system, successful court processes or victims’ protection. It is especially problem in cases when trafficking in human beings is happening transnationally and several countries are included in the process of transport.

The paper analyses the different definitions of trafficking in human beings characteristic for different timelines. Every each one of them is connected to different terms used to point out trafficking in human beings, and each term covers different group of victims, narrowing or widening it. The full chronological period can be divided into three parts, classified by the term used to mark the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings.

### Short overview of the defining process of trafficking in human beings before the Palermo Protocol

The process of international discussion regarding trafficking in human beings has started in 1904 with the term trafficking in “white slaves”, then continued in 1921 with the term trafficking in women and children, and in 1949 it continued with the newest and widest term, trafficking in human beings.

The period of 90s of the XIX and the beginning of the XX century were marked with the suppression campaigns against trafficking in “white slaves” that was very different in comparison to the slave trade in the Transatlantic period. It was a period of transport of women and children in brothels where they were sexually exploited.

---

<sup>5</sup> Ibid, p.8

There is an understanding by which the term trafficking in “white slaves” is used as a term to explain a process during which women and girls were transported to other countries under false promises of success, prosperity and wealth, where they were exploited as prostitutes.<sup>6</sup> Thereto, main problem were kidnapping cases of European women used for prostitution by nonwestern men or other “inferiors”, in the countries of South America, Africa or in the Orient.<sup>7</sup>

The international community answered these situations with few international documents whose main goal was trafficking’s suppression.

Before the first document was brought, two conferences were held in Paris in 1899 and 1902. Two years later, the world got the International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic.<sup>8</sup> This International Agreement does not defines trafficking in “white slaves”, but accents the need of help for victims and the process of their repatriation, especially evaluating the migrant side of trafficking.

Six years later, once again in Paris, the International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic<sup>9</sup> was opened for member countries and signatures. It was a document which was directed towards criminalization of the phenomenon. Article 1 of the Convention says that *whoever, in order to gratify the passions of another person, has procured, enticed, or led away, even with her consent, a woman or girl under age, for immoral purposes, shall be punished, notwithstanding that the various acts constituting the offence may have been committed in different countries.* Whereas, article 2 says that *whoever, in order to gratify the passions of another person, has, by fraud, or by means of violence, threats, abuse of authority, or any other method of compulsion, procured, enticed, or led away a woman or girl over age, for immoral purposes, shall also be punished, notwithstanding that the various acts constituting the offence may have been committed in different countries.*<sup>10</sup> What is also important to be mentioned is that in 1948 the both documents were upgraded with a Protocol authorized by the United Nations. With the Protocol the migration aspect and criminalization were merged into only one document. From articles 1 and 2 where the criminalization aspect is elaborated we may conclude that during those times, trafficking in “white slaves” or white slave traffic was defined as procuring, enticing and leading away a woman or girl over age, by using fraud, means of violence, threats, abuse of authority, for immoral purposes or gratifying the passions of another person.

The next step is made in 1921, when the second chronological period starts. In Geneva, during the International Conference held by the League of Nations, the International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic of Women and Children<sup>11</sup> was opened for signatories. With this Convention, international community accepts the

<sup>6</sup> Љупчо Арнаудовски. “Криминалитетот “Трговија со луѓе” – проблеми во дефинирањето” *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 57

<sup>7</sup> Џо Доезема. “Распуштени жени или изгубени жени? Повторно појавување на митот за белото робје во современиот дискурс за трговијата со жени” *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 214

<sup>8</sup> Opened for signatures on the 18<sup>th</sup> of May 1904 and entered into force on the 18<sup>th</sup> of July 1905, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/whiteslavetraffic1904.html> [10.11.2016]

<sup>9</sup> Opened for signatures on the 4<sup>th</sup> of May 1910 and entered into force on the 5<sup>th</sup> of July 1920, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/whiteslavetraffic1910.html> [10.11.2016]

<sup>10</sup> Article 1 and 2 from the International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/whiteslavetraffic1910.html> [10.11.2016]

<sup>11</sup> Opened for signatures on the 30<sup>th</sup> of September 1921 and entered into force on the 15<sup>th</sup> of June 1922, available at <http://www.vilp.de/Enpdf/e158.pdf> [10.11.2016]

fact that victims of trafficking in human beings can be people from other races, and children from male gender. At that moment only adult males still were not recognized as possible targets for traffickers.

Similar to the last one, the International Slavery Convention<sup>12</sup> was the first international documents dedicated to slavery, which accepted the existence of modern forms of slavery, including trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation. In its provisions, slavery is defined *as the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised*.<sup>13</sup>

The last of these Conventions that uses the term trafficking in women and children, is the International Convention for the Suppression of Traffic in Women of Full Age<sup>14</sup>. This Convention widens the term trafficker under which by its provisions we understand everyone included in the trafficking process, even people who tried to commit such a process outside a country.

The third and last period starts in 1949 with the Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others.<sup>15</sup> This document is a creation of the United Nations and is the first document whose provisions are obligatory for its member states. It was ratified by 66 countries, mostly because of the obligation to criminalize prostitution if the document is ratified. Also, it has the adjective as the first document in which trafficking in human beings was defined. It is the first document in which the term trafficking in human beings is used for the first time. In this way the international community accepted the fact that everyone, no matter od gender, race or age, can become a victim of trafficking.

In the Article 1 of the Convention, the Parties *agree to punish any person who, to gratify the passions of another: (1) Procures, entices or leads away, for purposes of prostitution, another person, even with the consent of that person; (2) Exploits the prostitution of another person, even with the consent of that person*.<sup>16</sup>

Since this Convention, the legal space of the international community had a vacuum of 51 year, during which there were no new obligatory documents, but it was a period of many activities in direction of defining, suppression and prevention of trafficking in human beings. But, events starting from 1993 were the important ones, because they ended with a new document in 2000.

Before 1993, as a very important document we must mention the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)<sup>17</sup>, in whose article 6 the protection of women from trafficking in human beings and exploitation for prostitution is mentioned.

---

<sup>12</sup> Opened for signatures on the 25<sup>th</sup> of October 1926 and entered into force on the 9<sup>th</sup> of March 1927, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/slavery.pdf> [10.11.2016]

<sup>13</sup> Article 1 from the International Slavery Convention, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/slavery.pdf> [10.11.2016]

<sup>14</sup> Opened for signatures on the 11<sup>th</sup> of October 1933 and entered into force on the 24<sup>th</sup> of October 1934, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/women-traffic.html> [10.11.2016]

<sup>15</sup> Opened for signatures on the 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 1949 and entered into force on the 25<sup>th</sup> of July 1951, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/trafficpersons.pdf> [10.11.2016]

<sup>16</sup> Article 1 from Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/trafficpersons.pdf> [10.11.2016]

<sup>17</sup> Opened for signatures on the 18<sup>th</sup> of December 1979 and entered into force on the 3<sup>rd</sup> of September 1981, available at <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/text/econvention.htm> [10.11.2016]

In 1993, Vienna was hosting the World Conference on human rights during which analyzing few cases of trafficking of women processed in some European countries, was detected the fact that human rights are not respected. That's why one of the conclusions of the Conference was the fact that trafficking in human beings is a phenomenon during which human rights are not respected.

Two years later, in 1995, Beijing hosted the World Conference for women, when cases of trafficking for sexual exploitation whose victims from the Balkans and Columbia were presented. The result is including trafficking in human beings into the provisions of the Beijing Declaration (two articles).

These and many more documents clearly accent the necessity defining trafficking in human beings inside the human rights issue, because trafficking is a modern type of the old slavery. It is negation of the fundamental human rights, especially the freedom of movement and physical integrity.<sup>18</sup> This phenomenon is complex criminal behavior that is directly threatens human rights and freedoms and it has serious implications on stability, democracy and rule of law inside national and regional frameworks.<sup>19</sup>

### Defining trafficking in human beings in the Protocol of Palermo

A starting point in the examination of human trafficking should be slavery and the slave trade in ancient times as the origin of trafficking can be traced back to those practices. The key elements of slavery and the slave trade were the ownership of human beings for subsequent exploitation with the use of violence and threat, and deprivation of their liberties and freedoms.<sup>20</sup> Slave trading can be defined as the process of acquiring, recruiting, harboring, receiving, or transporting an individual, through any means and for any distance, into a condition of slavery or slave - like exploitation.<sup>21</sup> Slavery can be defined as the process of coercing labor or other services from a captive individual, through any means, including exploitation of bodies or body parts.<sup>22</sup> Slavery is a relation between two sides. It is a social and economic relation. Its core should be searched inside control over people, not into property.<sup>23</sup> It is a social and economic relation during which people are controlled by using violence or threats for using violence, without any material benefit and with economic exploitation.<sup>24</sup> Slavery and slave trade existed long before human trafficking, resulting today as a modern form of the old, good, business labyrinth.

Years later, legal systems, because of harmonization with European legislature were adjusted to international documents, newer methods were accepted, border controls, action against corruption, police actions and investigations, changes in legal and criminal incriminations. And such policies gave results. They decreased the level of

<sup>18</sup> Александар Штулхофер. " За поимот и за некои аспекти на трговијата со жени и деца заради сексуална експлоатација " *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 156

<sup>19</sup> Трпе Стојановски, " Елементи за превенција и сузбивање на трговијата со луѓе " *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 112

<sup>20</sup> Tom Obokata. *Trafficking of Human Beings from Human Rights Perspective*. ( Leiden – Boston: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2006), p.9

<sup>21</sup> Siddharth Kara, *Sex trafficking: Inside the business of modern slavery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009), p.5

<sup>22</sup> Ibid

<sup>23</sup> Kevin Bales, *New Slavery*. (Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2004), p.3

<sup>24</sup> Ibid, p.4

crimes, but caused changes of phenomenon's phenomenology. The human trafficking we knew mutated and overnight changed key points in the process.<sup>25</sup>

United Nations made an analysis during 1996 of the situation with human trafficking cases in the world. All the data was gathered by using information from government institutions and nongovernmental organizations. During 1997 - 2000, the draft texts of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime<sup>26</sup> and the three Protocols were prepared.<sup>27</sup> In 1998, the Commission that was formed by UN General Assembly in 1997 formed an ad hoc Committee to elaborate the Convention and its three additional Protocols.

The Convention and two of the Protocols were opened for signatures from 12<sup>th</sup> to 15<sup>th</sup> of December 2000 in the Palazzi di Giustizia, Palermo, Sicily, Italy, and afterwards in the UN Headquarters in New York, USA.

The importance of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children<sup>28</sup> should be analyzed from the aspect that it contains a wider and wide-ranging definition of human trafficking, but also in its obligations towards parties for suppression and prevention of the phenomenon, victims' protection, promoting of the importance of international cooperation.

Article 3, paragraph (a) of the Protocol of Palermo defines human trafficking (trafficking in persons) as *"the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs."*<sup>29</sup>

This definition accepts, but does not elaborate the fact that this criminal activity is multidimensional; it is a process of several phases, during which each phase has or is realized through several different criminal activities. Thus, the phenomenon is not manifested, realized as single criminal act, but as many different criminal activities which are either independent or are in addition to one another. All of those activities, together, form the human trafficking process.<sup>30</sup>

The Protocol's definition encourages a broad understanding of trafficking as involving three key elements: first, a series of distinct activities involved in the movement of people; second, a description of mechanisms that involve coercion and/or the abuse of power; and third, the use of the first and second factors for the purpose of

<sup>25</sup> Angelina Stanojoska. "Inside or outside: Human Trafficking Flows and changing Dimensions". Journal of Eastern European Criminal Law Vol.3 (1): 86

<sup>26</sup> Opened for signatures in 2000, entered into force in 2003, available at [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/covention\\_%20traff\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/covention_%20traff_eng.pdf) [13.11.2016]

<sup>27</sup> The three Protocols drafted were covering the areas of suppressing human trafficking; smuggling of migrants and weapons trade.

<sup>28</sup> Available at [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/covention\\_%20traff\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/covention_%20traff_eng.pdf) [13.11.2016]

<sup>29</sup> Article 3, Protocol of Palermo, available at [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/covention\\_%20traff\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/covention_%20traff_eng.pdf) [14.11.2016]

<sup>30</sup> Љупчо Арнаудовски. "Криминалитетот "Трговија со луѓе" – проблеми во дефинирањето" Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе (2004): 61

"exploitation." The activities are varied ("recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons") to allow distinct actors within a complex system to be understood as part of the problem and thereby addressed through both punitive and preventative policies. The mechanisms of coercion and/or the abuse of power ("threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person") are similarly general to include an array of means by which individuals are deprived of free choice and free will. The issue of exploitation is similarly broad with the understanding that it should include at least certain actions of great international concern ("the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.").<sup>31</sup>

The definition from the Protocol of Palermo contains a list of possible methods of exploitation; but it is important not to forget that the list is not emptied and that there is always a possibility for new exploitative methods.<sup>32</sup> It has a number of elements to suppress new forms of exploitation.<sup>33</sup> Also, all forms of exploitation are not defined in the Protocol of Palermo, but their definitions are part of other international documents.

Neither the term prostitution neither other forms of sexual exploitation are defined. The reasons for not defining the term prostitution are the different positions between radical feminism and the feminism of sexual work.<sup>34</sup>

Radical feminism defines prostitution as violence against women, it is a phenomenon which victimizes all women, accepts selling sexual services and objectifying women as sexual objects. On the other hand, the second opinion concludes that there two different types of prostitution - forced prostitution and voluntary prostitution. Forced prostitution and human trafficking are manifestations of the violence against women.<sup>35</sup> But, consent is either marginal either relative element, it gives seemingly free choice. Theoretically, used force can be present either during recruitment of the victims either during "the ending" of the process of trafficking, but also during the two processes.<sup>36</sup>

Paragraph (c) of the article 3 from the Protocol of Palermo is defining the process of trafficking in children. *The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered "trafficking in persons" even if this*

<sup>31</sup> Cherif Bassiouni. *Addressing International Human Trafficking in Women and Children for Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, 10<sup>th</sup> Specialization Course in International Criminal Law – Human Trafficking for Commercial Sexual Exploitation, ISISC (2010), p.5

<sup>32</sup> Silvia Scarpa. *Trafficking in human beings: Modern slavery* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), p.5

<sup>33</sup> UNODC. *Legislative Guide for the Implementation of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and The Protocols thereto* (New York: United Nations, 2004), p.269 [p.33] – Legislative Guide, available at <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/treaties/CTOC/legislative-guide.html> [14.11.2016]

<sup>34</sup> Silvia Scarpa. *Trafficking in human beings: Modern slavery* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), p.6

<sup>35</sup> Џо Доезема. "Распуштени жени или изгубени жени? Повторно појавување на митот за белото робје во современиот дискурс за трговијата со жени" *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 229

<sup>36</sup> Александар Штулхофер, " За поимот и за некои аспекти на трговијата со жени и деца заради сексуална експлоатација " *Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе* (2004): 159

*does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article.*<sup>37</sup> Paragraph (d) defines the term child as every person under the age of 18 years.

The modern, contemporary, definition from the Protocol of Palermo has few positive aspects elaborating the reality of modern slavery. It accepts all possible forms of exploitation and does not bound them only to sexual exploitation. Thereinafter, it is not focusing itself only to women and children as potential victims, but to everyone as potential victim of this crime. Third, there is no obligation for cross border transport of the victims for the existence of the crime, explaining that human trafficking can be internal, such as movement of the victims from one region to another. The definition contains elements of distortion of the victims' free will, for an example, use of force, fraud or an abuse of power, not forgetting the fact that adult people can decide over their life, the choice of working place and migration.<sup>38</sup>

## Conclusion

The process of creating a definition for a phenomenon or criminal activity is a serious process, it includes a long time of debating and a wide framework of different opinions that need to be narrowed and approximated to one another. The Protocol of Palermo's definition is a result of a decade of analysis, which was anticipated by a number of other international documents where the phenomenon's understandings change from the very narrow ones to widest ones.

It must be mentioned that the international community hasn't stopped developing international documents elaborating the phenomenon of human trafficking, its characteristics, etiology, prevention and protection of its victims. We should not forget the Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (2005) of the Council of Europe, where victims of trafficking are protected. This document defines victim of human trafficking for the first time, as every person who has become a subject of human trafficking.

There also the documents of the European Union, especially the Council Framework Decisions and the Protection Acts of the US Departments. Those are the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act and the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act. All of them define human trafficking as the most serious phenomenon of modern times.

But at the end of the day it should be concluded that defining of human trafficking is only the first step that should be undertaken. After a phenomenon is defined, actions should be undertaken. All obligations for member states should be directed towards suppression and prevention of this criminal activity, everything should be undertaken so modern slavery would be put out of business.

<sup>37</sup> Член 3, Протоколот за превенција, спречување и казнување на трговијата со луѓе посебно со жени и деца, достапен на [http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/covention\\_%20traff\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/covention_%20traff_eng.pdf)

<sup>38</sup> Организација за безбедност и соработка во Европа, *Прирачник за ревизија на законските регулативи против трговијата со луѓе (со посебен осврт на Југоисточна Европа)*, (Скопје: ОБСЕ, 2001), стр.50-51



### Bibliography

1. Арнаудовски, Љупчо. "Криминалитетот "Трговија со луѓе" – проблеми во дефинирањето" Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе (2004): 45 – 70;
2. Аристотел. Политика. Скопје: Слово, 2006;
3. Аристотел. Реторика. Скопје: Ѓурѓа, 2010;
4. Bales, Kevin. New Slavery. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2004;
5. Bassiouni, Cherif, " Addressing International Human Trafficking in Women and Children for Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century " 10<sup>th</sup> Specialization Course in International Criminal Law – Human Trafficking for Commercial Sexual Exploitation, ISISC (2010);
6. Бачановиќ, Оливер. " Правата, заштитата и помошта на жртвите во Конвенцијата на Советот на Европа за акција против трговијата со луѓе " Годишник на Полициската Академија (2007): 68 – 80;
7. Бикс, Карен, и Дилајла Амир. Глобалната секс – индустрија и препродажбата на луѓе. Lanham: Lexington books, 2009;
8. Доезема, Џо. " Распуштени жени или изгубени жени? Повторно појавување на митот за белото робје во современиот дискурс за трговијата со жени " Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе (2004): 213 – 256;
9. Kara, Siddharth. Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery. New York – Chichester: Columbia University Press, 2009;
10. Ниче, Фридрих. Волја за моќ. Скопје: Ѓурѓа, 2008;
11. Obokata, Tom. Trafficking of Human Beings from Human Rights Perspective. Leiden – Boston: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2006;
12. Организација за безбедност и соработка во Европа. Прирачник за ревизија на законските регулативи против трговијата со луѓе. Скопје: OSCE/ODIHR, 2001;
13. Roth, Mitchel P. Global Organized Crime. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2010;
14. Scarpa, Silvia. Trafficking in human beings: Modern slavery. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008;
15. Stanojoska, Angelina. "“Inside or outside: Human Trafficking Flows and changing Dimensions”. Journal of Eastern European Criminal Law Vol.3 (1):86 - 96;
16. Стојановски, Трпе. " Елементи за превенција и сузбивање на трговијата со луѓе" Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе (2004): 111 – 126;
17. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Legislative Guides for Implementation of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocol thereto. New York: United Nations, 2004, available at <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/treaties/CTOC/legislative-guide.html> [04.05.2010];
18. Штулхофер, Александар. " За поимот и за некои аспекти на трговијата со жени и деца заради сексуална експлоатација " Родова перспектива на трговијата со луѓе (2004): 155 – 166.

### International Documents

1. Council of Europe. Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, available at <http://www.coe.int/trafficking>;
2. European Union. Council Framework Decision of 19 July 2002 on combating trafficking in human beings, available at [http://english.bnrm.nl/Images/EU%20Council%20Framework%20Decision%20of%2019%20July%202002%20on%20combating%20trafficking%20in%20human%20beings\\_tcm64-83547.pdf](http://english.bnrm.nl/Images/EU%20Council%20Framework%20Decision%20of%2019%20July%202002%20on%20combating%20trafficking%20in%20human%20beings_tcm64-83547.pdf);

3. International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/whiteslavetraffic1904.html>;
4. International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/whiteslavetraffic1910.html>;
5. International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic of Women and Children, available at <http://www.vilp.de/Enpdf/e158.pdf>;
6. International Convention for the Suppression of Traffic in Women of Full Age, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/women-traffic.html>;
7. International Labour Organization. Convention concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour, available at <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/n0ilo29.htm>;
8. League of Nations. International Slavery Convention, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/slavery.pdf>;
9. Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/slaverytrade.pdf>;
10. United Nations. Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/pdf/trafficpersons.pdf>;
11. United Nations. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, available at <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/text/econvention.htm>;
12. United Nations. Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, available at <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/protocol/text.htm>;
13. United Nations. Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. 2000, available at <http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf>;
14. United Nations. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000, available at <http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf>;
15. United Nations. World Conference on Human Rights (Vienna, 14 – 25 June, 1993). Vienna Declaration, available at <http://www.unhcr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/%28symbol%29/a.conf.157.23.en>;
16. United Nations. World Conference on Women (Beijing, 4 – 15 September, 1995). Beijing Declaration, available at <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/declar.htm>;
17. U.S.Congress. Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000. Public Law 106 – 386 – Oct. 28, 2000, available at <http://www.isisc.org/public/Trafficking%20Victims%20Protection%20Act%20of%202000%20-%20Banks.pdf>.